Meeting art with art: Arts based methods enhance researcher reflexivity in research with mental health service users
Tríona McCaffrey
Jane Edwards

Abstract

This paper presents a rationale for arts based practices in music therapy research, and provides an example of using ABR techniques in research. Arts based materials are increasingly demonstrated to have capacity to extend processes of reflexivity and analysis in a range of qualitative health research studies. By comparison music therapy research studies have rarely employed arts based methods or techniques. There is a need for more studies in music therapy that employ arts based research to demystify and elaborate a wider range of creative approaches within music therapy inquiry. In the study described in this paper ABR was used to reflect on the contribution of a service user in a community mental health context who participated in a focus group about his experiences of music therapy. ABR was found to offer a creative way to engage service users, and to deepen and extend the researcher’s reflexivity when responding to materials created by research participants.
Arts based research

Arts based research (ABR) has an established presence in discipline areas relevant to music therapy research including education (Cahnmann-Taylor & Siegesmund, 2013) and nursing (Simons & McCormack, 2007). ABR is situated alongside developments in practice-based research in the arts described as “…research undertaken by a practitioner such as a performer, composer and/or teacher on his or her own work” (Ginsborg, 2014 p. 78). This is sometimes termed artistic research (Borgdorff, 2010) although divergent views exist as to how artistic production functions as a form of inquiry (Rust, 2007). Performative social science is a term used by some researchers outside of the arts when arts media are the basis of their research (Jones & Leavy, 2014).

Arts based research practices have been described as “methodological tools used by qualitative researchers across the disciplines during all phases of social research, including data collection, analysis, and representation” (Leavy, 2009, p. ix). The arts are available to all as they are inherently human, social, and communicative; there is no cultural group that does not have a relationship with any or all of music, dance, story-telling, or visual art (Dissanayake, 2008). ABR is positioned as offering a “reinterpretation of the methods and ethics of human social research” (Finley, 2003, p. 281).

Arts based research can involve literary writing, music, performance, dance, visual art, film, and other creative media to illuminate human experience and perspective (Leavy, 2011; Ledger & Edwards, 2011). Newer technologies including the internet and digital media allow multiple innovative arts based opportunities; a rich vein for further exploration (Ledger & Edwards, 2011). Art creation involves generative processes including multiple acts of creativity and creating and/or re-perceiving, engaging forms that are not necessarily driven by
a narrative structure or narrative intent. These can be described as non-narrative as many processes and products in arts creation transcend literal meanings.

In a review of arts based research inquiry in music therapy it was noted that the number of ABR research reports is relatively small (Ledger & Edwards, 2011). Music therapy researchers have described moving to their data through body listening processes (Trondalen, 2007), engaging in creative writing (Gilberton, 2013), poetry creation (Ledger & Edwards, 2011), and using multiple creative media (Seabrook & Arnason, 2010). The products are sometimes shown in music therapy reports of ABR but in many cases it is more important to describe what is created in terms of new thinking or unexpected experiences that occur through using art. For example, Vaillancourt (2011) used the dynamic descriptor of an imaginative nest to indicate the experience of her mentoring groups with music therapists using arts based research methods.

Edwards (2011) developed Creative Insight Method as an arts based process that can be used within research as well as within team building endeavours in healthcare or community service contexts. In her approach she perceives that the arts,

…occupy an important space culturally in which individuals, groups and societies can consider more deeply their relationship to each other, the past, and their hopes for the future. The arts allow the emotionality of complex experiences to be manifest in ways that permit reflection and insight as well as to re-experience, or further engage, highly nuanced dimensions of emotional states.

(Edwards, 2011, np)

ABR has been presented as a radical alternative to the increasing conservatism of qualitative methods (Jagodzinski & Wallin 2013) but we prefer to position ABR as a relatively unconstrained assortment of ideas, traditions, and techniques that can be used in any research undertaking to the extent that the researcher feels inspired or able. Researchers
are encouraged to find ways to use the arts in any way that is meaningful and helpful to them in conducting their projects, remembering that although art processes or products may be created this is not always the primary goal. Unlike Beer (2015) we propose that all arts are available to music therapy researchers; the choice of ABR techniques and methods do not need to be restricted to music based processes and outcomes, especially since ABR aims to provoke new interdisciplinary spaces (Rust, 2007).

Readers are encouraged to avoid creating an epistemological pigeon hole for ABR as these artistic techniques and methods can be applied in any type of research study, whichever method or orientation is engaged (Edwards, 2013). The social and collective utility of art can also be found in Dissanayake’s ethological musings on the social dimensions of music;

Listeners know, tacitly if not overtly, that fellow humans are making the music that they hear and that a fellow human has composed it. In this sense, all human music is experienced socially…, reinforcing the human bonds to be found in experiencing abstract patterns of sound that are meaningful and emotionally significant to other humans.

Dissanayake 2008 p. 183

The authors acknowledge the possibility that a profession with demonstrable social status anxiety (Cameron, 2014; Edwards, 2015) may not readily embrace the creative option of ABR. Einstein and Forinash (2013) describe this as, “Fear that art is not enough and will not be understood” (p. 84). Rather than insist on one way that ABR should be conceptualised and conducted in music therapy we hope that by sharing events within a research study conducted in a community mental health service we might foster creative intent in others. Gilbertson (2013) described this spark being fanned when coming into contact with emerging work undertaken at the Music & Health Research Group at the University of Limerick between 2007 and 2010. In particular Gilbertson referred to the second author’s relational and
ecological approach in music therapy along with the use of arts based methods as inspiring a new creative phase in his thinking and integration of practice and research (Gilbertson, 2013). In turn the second author’s inspiration comes from her participation in the invited qualitative meetings at the village of Sauen hosted by Professor Mechtild Jahn Langenberg from the University of the Arts, Berlin. She was fascinated by the arts based research interest group which collaborated and then reported back to the larger group their experiences and discoveries.

In its most ambitious iterations ABR proposes to offer participants and researchers creative exploration of research questions and issues in order to invent new traditions through which questioning and discovery of the social world is possible (Bagnoli, 2009), and by which “new insight, meaning and values” can be evinced (Eaves, 2014, p. 149). Scholarship and research findings are made accessible to a wider audience through arts representation of ideas and experiences (Knowles and Cole 2008). ABR is a means to access highly conceptual yet fundamental aspects of social life (Sinner, et. al, 2006), while at the same time arts based techniques and methods provide alternate means by which to explore real world issues (Leavy, 2011). ABR aims to engender conversations and raise challenging questions allowing tensions to arise, and ambiguity to be tolerated (Barone & Eisner, 1997). Arts based practices can be employed at any or multiple stages of the research pathway; to create new knowledge through representation of breakthrough findings, to share new insights, or to evaluate progress (Lafrénière, Hurlimann, Menuz, & Godard, 2012). Arts based processes can also deepen insights into the dynamics and interactions within research projects (Ledger & Edwards, 2011; Schenstead, 2012).

The representational forms of inquiry generated from arts based methods, along with the experience of non-narrative generative processes, can be thought-provoking and engaging for researchers, other research participants, and the audience. We resist the consignment of
ABR to a numbered list of types of media or purposes, and contend that since it exists in the margins of contemporary research (Jones & Leavy, 2014) it might be anticipated that it enjoy an extensive time of flourishing in music therapy before an inevitable \textit{social closure} occurs by which expertism and exclusion frame it more rigidly through the hegemonic and colonizing actions of traditional scholarship.

\textit{Setting the scene}

The following case example outlines the response by the first author to a drawing created in one of a series of arts based focus groups attended by service users. Participants had the opportunity to share their experiences of attending the music therapy services provided at a community mental health programme. Three songs and one visual image were created by group members about their experiences of music therapy in mental health services. In facilitating the focus group the first author considered how she might respond to the songs and image that had been created, and was somewhat daunted by where to start. She had multiple roles as focus group facilitator, and therefore witness, to the creation of the songs and drawings, and she was also a qualified music therapist mystified as to how some of the resultant materials might be related to the participants’ experience of music therapy. This case example shows the process of responding to the art image created by a focus group member.

\textit{Finding a way forward}

In discussion between the first and second authors about how to deepen an understanding of the materials generated in the groups we agreed that it would not be possible to involve focus group participants further without an additional ethical review process which from our experience would likely be unsuccessful. Conducting an analysis of the materials generated in the groups in order to arrive at what might be considered \textit{conclusive findings} did not seem possible. The focus group participants had not consented to
have their products *analysed* but rather *presented* to others in a way that would highlight their own personal views of music therapy. We agreed that a possible next step forward was for the first author to begin a reflexive process whereby her actions, observations, impressions, irritations and emotions about the drawing became a further data source to deepen her ongoing reflection and analysis.

*Bringing multiple sources together*

In many qualitative methods triangulation contributes to a holistic perspective of the phenomenon or phenomena under investigation to enhance the researcher’s depth and breadth of understanding (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; Fenech et al, 2005). Traditionally triangulation can be accomplished through such procedures as *member checking*, where the primary researchers analysis is examined by another researcher for validity and consistency, through writing a reflexive journal which documents the processes in the research, or by any other process where the materials under analysis are reflected upon from different viewpoints (Bradt, et al., 2013). In the study reported in this paper the process of triangulation was re-purposed in responding to the arts materials. Multiple data sources were accessed as part of a reflexive process to deepen the first author’s engagement with the materials, and her understanding of the experiences of service users.

*Choosing a medium of response*

The following case example describes how the first author composed and recorded a song, informed by the concept of triangulation, to respond to a visual image (see image 1) created by one focus group participant called ‘Jack Sparrow’ (participant’s chosen pseudonym).

*Self-portrait* Image 1
Three data sources were informative the response to the image. These included the focus group transcripts that offered verbal information on the how this image had been produced and the context in which it was created. Reflexive journal notes that had been recorded after each focus group occurred were also consulted. Material from these data sources were distilled and organised in a manner that could coherently and directly inform the compositional process in the form of, a) participant comments about the visual image generated, b) a written account that outlined the context in which the image emerged and c) the first author’s perceptions of the participant’s visual image.

Data source 1: Participant comments

Reflection on Jack Sparrow’s visual image commenced with extracting comments and reflections related to his art-work from the focus-group transcripts that were generated from audio recordings. The comments contextualised how the image emerged and how it reflected his experiences of music therapy. After carefully reading each focus group transcript Jack Sparrow’s comments in relation to the creation of his image were highlighted to capture Jack Sparrow’s perspective the creating of his image. Space was also left in this table for insertion of comments and interpretations of this image (see table 1).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Multiple perspectives: Jack Sparrow’s visual image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jack Sparrow comments</strong> <em>(Focus group 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jack Sparrow comments</strong> <em>(Focus group 3)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TM’s comments and interpretations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data source 2: Emerging context

Reflexive journal entries and extracted information from these that pertained to Jack Sparrow’s image were consulted. These were then considered in relation to the focus group transcripts that provided further contextual information about the art-work creation. The
following provides the first author’s account of an emerging context relating to the creation of Jack Sparrow’s self-portrait in the first focus group.

*Before the focus group commenced, I carefully arranged a variety of art materials in the centre of a large square table that had a chair positioned at three of its four sides. This included coloured pencils, paints, chalks, felt tip pens, crayons, paint brushes, a water jar and paper in different sizes and colours. The musical instruments were to the set to the side of the table. These included a keyboard with a sustain pedal, a guitar, a jembay and a variety of hand percussion [see Image 2].*

*Image 2*

*At the start of the focus group participants ‘Jack Sparrow’ and ‘Shady’ (both participant’s chosen pseudonyms) completed informed consent and recording forms. We then held introductions and had a brief discussion about the purpose of the*
project. I asked both participants to think about what it is like to go to music therapy, adding that this could be reflected upon using visual-art or song. Jack Sparrow said that he would like to draw something. I was somewhat taken aback when he asked for an ‘ordinary pencil’ given the array of coloured materials on front of him. After fetching a pencil I turned his attention to the different sizes of paper on the table and he replied by asking for ‘an ordinary sheet’ and ‘something to lean on’ while he drew.

Jack Sparrow initially pursued the creation of his visual image quietly but as the group progressed he joined in discussion about a song writing process that Shady had chosen to work upon. After a few minutes when I enquired with Jack Sparrow as to how he was getting on, he told me that he had his drawing done and that he was happy with it. He told me that he drew himself later adding that he was smoking a cigarette in the picture and that he loved music. He told me that he had been attending for three years, that music therapy cheered him up and puts him in good form. He also revealed to me that he sometimes plays drums and guitar. I took a photograph of Jack Sparrow’s visual image and he took the original with him at the end of the focus group.

After the focus group concluded I reviewed the visual image created and it struck me that the person in the image had a beard and glasses yet Jack Sparrow had none. I also noticed that the word ‘music’ appeared to be misspelt. In signing documentation earlier on I hadn’t noticed any literacy problems on Jack Sparrow’s behalf yet I worried that this may have perhaps been a source of discomfort to him. I did not know what ‘to do’ with the image.

Data source 3: Multiple views
Having read Jack Sparrow’s comments and considered the emerging context account above, the first author reflected upon the original image (see image 1) and noted down the thoughts and questions it raised. Multiple perspectives were engaged in this reflection; as a group participant in which the art work was created, as a music therapist wanting to understand more about service user experience of therapy and, as a qualitative researcher trying to be immersed in the potential meanings of the art work while standing back from the materials in order to see the bigger picture. Further reflections and comments were then added to the transcript of Jack Sparrow’s contribution (see Table 1: Multiple Perspectives). This composite of responses was then used in creating the song.

Creating the song response

After considering multiple viewpoints and questions, the first author worked with the materials in Table 1 to create a response through song. Jack Sparrow’s comments were incorporated into a chorus of service user lyrics with only minor word insertions made for the purposes of sense-making (in red font). Highlighting these insertions aided coherency and demonstrated repeated efforts to maintain the integrity of the service user perspective.

After completion of the lyrics, the musical style and melody of the song was chosen as the final stage of the reflexive process. The musical style was informed by the prevailing mood of the focus group at the time the visual-image was created. A reggae style of music was chosen so as to reflect the casual manner in which Jack Sparrow had approached his drawing whereby he shrugged his shoulders and said “I might draw so”. The first author kept an image of Jack Sparrow’s demeanour in mind whilst crafting the song melody in a manner that would increase the understanding of the song’s narrative, the lyric’s semiotic meaning and the emotional content of the lyrics. The final song featured five sections; 1) service-user chorus, 2) researcher verse (italicised), 3) service-user chorus, 4) a researcher bridge (italicised) and 5) service-user chorus [see Table 2]. These different sections serve to
illuminated multiple perspectives and thoughts of the service user participant and researcher in relation to the visual-art work that portrays human experience of music therapy. A recording of the song can be listened to at link to be included about here

Table 2: Response to the visual image

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I might draw so, I might draw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have you an ordinary sheet, an ordinary pencil, something to lean on, no colour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I drew myself, smokin’ a cigarette</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’m happy with that, I’ve done it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It cheers me up, the music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It’s music therapy, three years listening to music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It puts me in good form, it’s the music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I love music, put down that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An ordinary pencil, no colour was desired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Something to lean on, do you lean on your music therapist?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I see your picture, you’re smokin’ a fag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yet he has a beard and glasses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I see you now you have none.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You drew yourself, you’re happy with that, do you look happy?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lots of space between the lines, lots of room to interpret.

Three years, a long time, I bet there’s lots to say

It cheers you up, improves your mood, music is your love

I might draw so, I might draw
I might draw so, I might draw

Have you an ordinary sheet, an ordinary pencil, something to lean on, no colour
I drew myself, smokin’ a cigarette
I’m happy with that, I’ve done it
It cheers me up, the music
It’s music therapy, three years listening to music

It puts me in good form, it’s the music.

I love music, put down that.

A misspelt word, can words be hard?

Is this art? Who decides its merit?

I have so many questions, what does this say about therapy?

How to show to others? How to share your ‘voice’?

So beautifully simple and personal to you

These ‘impressions’ start with you
Your love, your music.

I might draw so, I might draw
I might draw so, I might draw
Have you an ordinary sheet, an ordinary pencil, something to lean on, no colour
I drew myself, smokin’ a cigarette
I’m happy with that, I’ve done it
It cheers me up, the music
It’s music therapy, three years listening to music

It puts me in good form, it’s the music.

I love music, put down that.

Findings

This case example illustrates how multiple data sources can be incorporated into a process of triangulation in responding to a product created within an ABR study. Reflexive journal notes, transcripts of focus groups in which the materials were created were reviewed and organised to inform the process of composing a song. Through using the direct comments of participants, with minimal additions from the researcher, the song lyrics highlight the participant experience of creating and reflecting upon one’s own art work. The researcher was able to present multiple viewpoints and questions about the art work and engage questions that emerged for her in using an arts based process of inquiry in a reflexive creative process.
Rather than employing triangulation for the purposes of *completeness* as suggested by Fenech et al (2005), triangulation is proposed as being a type of reinterpretation that allows for deepening understandings by using an arts based process. As Rolling (2010) has described,

...every idea we embody and/or signify, and every model through which we interpret aggregated knowledge and significance is subject to *reinterpretation* even at the same time as there are social regularities, norms, and discursive fields which are fortified to resist such reinterpretations. Acts of reinterpretation have always been a threat to the continuity of dominant paradigms of thought and patterns of behaviour (p. 107).

Through the process of composing and singing the song it became clearer that Jack Sparrow’s experiences of music therapy were founded in his love of music. This message was written on the original art work and the first author’s appreciation of this sentiment was enhanced and intensified through composing the song. The resultant song provided a creative process to expand and illuminate experiences of the visual material. As a music therapist, the first author became aware that perhaps some people don’t come to music therapy because it offers a form of psychological therapy that will in some way *treat* or *help* them with the challenges they face through dealing with illness and problematic symptoms, but rather the starting point is musical interest or desire within a frame of reference that places music as pleasurable, motivating, and fun.

**Discussion**

The impetus for responding to an arts based product through song composition was multifaceted. In responding to the arts based materials generated in the focus groups, the first author was guided by the recommendation that the researcher possess mastery in their chosen method of inquiry (Barone & Eisner, 2011); her skills as professional musician and music therapist were then engaged in writing a song. The song served as a means to draw upon
important contextual information that if disregarded, might remain unnoticed in processes of analysis and dissemination. The music and lyrics provided a creative frame in which to reveal and hold accompanying factors such as the researcher’s reaction to the materials, including her ambivalence, and her thoughts and emotions.

Proponents of arts based research have encouraged further development theoretically and methodologically (Lafrenière, Hurlimann, Menuz, & Godard, 2012; Ledger & Edwards, 2011). The case example presented focuses upon the question of what to do with arts based materials after they have been generated by research participants. The response highlights congruence with the research question and the underlying ethical and theoretical stance of the researchers.

Arts based research practices and techniques are gaining traction in healthcare research. It is therefore important to reflect upon how products of such creative practices are treated by researchers in ways that address the interpersonal and situated contexts in which they emerge (Lafrenière et al., 2012). Music therapy research using more established social science methods such as Grounded Theory and Phenomenology have emphasised the need for rigor at all stages of the research but especially in processes of interpretation and analysis (for example, O’Callaghan, 2012; O’Callaghan & Magill, 2009). In arts based processes the term rigor is rarely used, instead the ABR researcher works within boundaries of transparency, truth, and meaning making (Finley, 2003) in all considerations and processes in the research where truth refers to the capacity for honesty and critical self-reflection.

The potential for works created in ABR sessions to reach out to and resonate with an audience in many different ways testifies to the humanity of their creators (Leavy, 2011). A core principle of ABR is that artefacts speak for themselves (Leavy, 2009) while eliciting multi-faceted viewpoints when presented to others. The development of these artefacts occurs within a highly complex social world. Therefore as the example reported here indicates, an
arts based reflexive process can provide insights for the research and further nuance the contribution of art work generated in the research study.

**Conclusion**

As an emerging assortment of methods and techniques that have not yet been institutionalised, ABR has remained relatively free from paradigmatic constraints and conflicts. We celebrate this opportunity to further promote the novel and exciting possibilities for music therapy researchers engaging ABR. This freedom can allow for development of innovative research procedures that draw on multiple individual and theoretical perspectives as exemplified in this case study through composing and recording a song.

This case study reveals that mental health treatment in music therapy begins with an enjoyment or interest in a creative medium within a wellness rather than deficit paradigm. Many service users find music therapy helpful because they experience it as “the opposite of treatment” (Solli & Rolvsjord, 2015, p. 67). The wellness paradigm underpins the recovery approach, promoting and endorsing the capacities and strengths of mental health service users. Therapy engagement in which capacities rather than limitations are the focus of attention resonate with contemporary models of music therapy practice including resource-oriented music therapy (Rolvsjord, 2004), community music therapy (Pavlicevic & Ansdell, 2004), and culture-centred music therapy (Stige, 2002).
References


Cameron, C. (2014). Does disability studies have anything to say to music therapy? And would music therapy listen if it did? *Voices*, 14(3) np


[http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3740602/](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3740602/)
doi:10.3402/qhw.v8i0.20604


Study data of a scientific project with elephant seals in Tasmania was re-purposed as graphic notation on invitation from the scientific team and performed by musicians as a way to find new connections and patterns in the data (Hodges et al. 2012).

Social closure is a concept devised by the philosopher and sociologist Max Weber (1978) to refer to the way groups act to assure the best commercial interests of a particular behaviour or activity. It is regularly used as a theory to understand the behaviour of professional groups in credentialing, training, and professionalizing; creating a system in which some can be included and others are excluded (Edwards, 2015).